



Explorations in Schenkerian Analysis. Edited by David Beach and Su Yin Mak. Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2016. xii + 359 pp. ISBN 978-1-58046-559-5.

Reviewed by: William M. Marvin, Eastman School of Music

Soon after the publication of *Bach to Brahms: Essays on Musical Design and Structure* (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2015), David Beach has edited yet another anthology of essays by leading Schenkerian theorists, this time in collaboration with Su Yin Mak. A wide-ranging collection of fifteen essays, framed with an editorial introduction and a substantial appendix, *Explorations in Schenkerian Analysis* is published in posthumous dedication to Edward Laufer (1938-2014), a prominent musician who studied, taught, and wrote about music using the analytic

method of Heinrich Schenker (1868-1935). The volume is organized chronologically by composer, a logical choice given that each essay treats either a single composition, or a few works written during the same time period. The collection reflects Laufer's analytic predilections in that it focuses not just on the twelve composers favoured by Schenker, but also explores secondary figures from the common practice period, both well known (Verdi, Dvorák) and more obscure (Anton Eberl, Niccolò Jommelli), in addition to composers who extended tonal practice in the early twentieth-century (R. Strauss and C. Debussy). As noted in the volume's introduction, less attention is accorded to the high classical composers (Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven) than is usual in such collections.

The essays need not be read in order, and there is no explicit cross-referencing among the analyses presented here. After perusing the introduction to get a sense of the contents, readers might move directly to the appendix, an extended interview with Edward Laufer conducted by Stephen Slottow at Laufer's home near Halifax, Nova Scotia in 2003. This interview contextualizes Laufer's approach to analysis, composition, repertoire, and pedagogy in terms of his own experiences as a student and teacher, along with fascinating asides on major figures in musical performance, composition and scholarship. The interview presents a warm portrait of a colleague whose absence is deeply felt throughout the volume. The fifteen analytic contributions all gain resonance by their being situated in the context of Edward Laufer's work.

Several of the authors composed their material to foreground relationships with Laufer's scholarship and teaching. Charles Burkhart's analysis of J.S. Bach's C-major fugue from book 1 of the



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/).

Well-Tempered Clavier is presented as an open letter to Laufer. In addition, Leslie Kinton, Timothy Jackson, and Don McLean all frame their articles in terms of personal reminiscences of Laufer as a teacher and colleague, and each author explains how his work impacted their analyses. The editors might have intervened more to strengthen the tie-ins to Laufer's work; one example of this is Su Yin Mak's own contribution, in which her prototype-based approach to sonata form is methodologically related to Laufer's well-known article on voice-leading in classical development sections (*Studies in Music from the University of Western Ontario* 13, 1991). Also to be regretted is that beyond the cover art, the volume does not include any of Laufer's own analyses, either reprinted or unpublished material. Hopefully another opportunity will emerge for his many unpublished analyses to gain a wider audience. The final paper of the collection, by Boyd Pomeroy, tacitly reminded this reader of Laufer's conference presentations; both authors are well known for their multi-paged handouts of voice-leading graphs that provide hours of post-conference study material.

The editors and the University of Rochester Press are to be applauded for the strong production values of this volume. The many voice-leading graphs are carefully reproduced, without the all-too-frequent pixilation or dropout of staff lines found in recent music theory publications. One might quibble with the decision to compose endnotes by chapter rather than footnotes, but in sum, this is one of the most impressive volumes of its kind. The accuracy and visual clarity of the many voice-leading graphs by authors using differing graphing styles is particularly worthy of praise here.

As might be expected, the volume focuses on close readings of individual pieces from a perspective of voice-leading and common-practice tonal norms. Authors are concerned with how individual motivic details relate to larger voice-leading continuities, formal design, and narrative considerations. Of particular interest to practitioners of Schenker's theory will be the variety of analytical predilections within this collection: while it is fairly certain that each author represented here would describe themselves as a traditional Schenkerian theorist and analyst, several of the analytic procedures found in this volume conflict with each other in terms of underlying decision-making processes and interpretation of the theory. This state of affairs can be traced back to Schenker's students, whose journal *Der Dreiklang* exhibited similar internal dissonance in 1937-38. While many studies have been published in recent years focusing on specific aspects of Schenkerian theory and advocating for one or another preferred mode of interpretation, no consensus seems to have emerged. While it may be rather late in the game to attempt a reconciliation regarding underlying theoretical considerations in the Schenkerian community, the lack of agreement is certainly one area of weakness that detractors of the theory have taken note of in recent years.

A brief review cannot do justice to the many analytic and theoretical insights contained in the essays collected here. In addition to the editors' own fine contributions (both Beach and Mak are well known for their analytic work on the music of Franz Schubert), highlights of the collection include analyses by Roger Kamien (Chopin's Prelude in B-flat, Op. 28 No. 21), William Rothstein (Schumann's *Manfred* Overture), and Matthew Brown (Richard Strauss's "Dance of the Seven Veils" from *Salome*). Among the more theoretically-driven articles, Poundie Burstein's exploration of

Heinrich Koch's theory of form to uncover 18th-century norms that current theories mislabel as deformational, and Boyd Pomeroy's exploration of "dominant" chords on the raised and lowered roots of that scale degree in the music of Claude Debussy, stand out for their clarity and for breaking new ground. As with most such collections, this one provides us with a valuable overview of current research and analytical practices by major scholars. It should be read widely by Schenkerian practitioners, by performers and listeners interested in the specific compositions analyzed, and by students of tonal theory. The volume serves as a fitting tribute to Edward Laufer and his life in music.

William M. Marvin
Eastman School of Music